



Science Committee Meeting Notes

Held October 4, 2017 – Coachella

Prepared by the Consensus Building Institute

Key Outcomes

- Carol Roberts, U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service, will serve as the new chair of the Science Committee. Doug Barnum, USGS, is retiring later this year.
- The Science Committee will submit comments as a committee on the draft work plan for the 10-Year Management Plan.
- The Science Committee will plan to host a science meeting in 2018 to increase awareness and deepen understanding of the breadth of the research underway on the Salton Sea.

Action Items

Timeline	Who	What
10/11/2017	Doug Barnum	Send out doodle poll to schedule conference call for week of 10/23 to discuss preliminary comments on work plan
10/20/2017	Science Committee members	Submit preliminary comments on work plan to Carol Roberts
10/23	Carol Roberts	Review preliminary comments, identify discussion questions for conference call, and distribute to the committee
Week of 10/23	Science Committee	Hold conference call to discuss key questions
~ 10/27		Submit comments to State
By next meeting	Earl Withycombe	Draft some guideline language about committee members who are regulatory staff reviewing dust mitigation measures

Review Process for 10-Year Management Plan Work Plan

The State presented its draft Work Plan at the Oct. 4th morning All-Committees meeting. The Committee agreed to submit comments as a group. The State will post its memo on water supply and demand for Salton Sea Management Program projects shortly after the meeting, but the input data for the models will not yet be available.. To facilitate this process, the Committee will follow these steps:

- Doug Barnum will send out a doodle poll to schedule a conference call the week of 10/23.
- By 10/20, Committee members will send preliminary comments to Carol Roberts.
- Carol will review preliminary comments and frame discussion questions for conference call.
- Week of 10/23, the Committee will hold a conference call to discuss comments and agree on process for finalizing comments to be submitted to the State.
- Comments are due 10/27, although Bruce Wilcox said the Committee could have a little bit of extra time if need.

2018 Science Meeting

Concept

Over the past few years, a number of institutions and individuals have conducted science- and Salton Sea-related investigations. Some of this is funded independently of State of California SSMP activities and Salton Sea-related federal programs. Many program managers and investigators are not aware of the range of research efforts and findings. The proposed science meeting is intended to bring together institutions and individuals in a central location to share findings and research objectives with a wide audience of interested scientists and managers.

A Committee member mentioned that identifying research needs might also be helpful. Another expressed concern that research needs seem endless and believes that narrowing or focusing to support implementation is paramount.

Committee members agreed that a meeting to share research findings would be valuable. One option might be to have published abstracts only with 15-minute presentations and 5 minutes of questions – no long write-ups would be necessary.

Additional Research Underway

Doug Barnum shared a preliminary list of research that he was aware of, and others added in.

At UCSD/SIO there are several folks doing research around the Salton Sea:

- Duncan Agnew – Strain meters setup in Salton City and two other sites within the Basin
- Amato Evan - Meteorology and climatology of dust storms in the region (and modeling)
- Jan Kliessel - Solar energy production and impacts of soiling

Other identified research:

- CDFW Bermuda Dunes - Fish /bird surveys
- UC Irvine is working with Comité Cívico on community monitoring data
- University of Southern California - Degree of toxicity coming from the playa
- UC San Diego and UC Irvine - Respiratory diseases in the Imperial Valley
- Bureau of Reclamation - Water quality

Logistics

This would likely be a two-day meeting. College of the Desert has tentatively agreed to provide space, but some funding would be required to pay for additional security and other costs. Originally proposed for January 2018, the committee agreed that this was too soon so later in 2018 would be the timeframe.

Outreach would also be necessary as a broad range of interested parties might wish to attend to listen and learn about research.

Next Steps

- Andrea Jones, Tom Andersen, and Carol Roberts will form the initial planning committee. They would like 1-2 other participants.
- The State offered assistance of consultant Josh Zipperman, Burke Rix Communications, to assist with outreach.

Committee Structure

The committee discussed and confirmed its proposed membership, for composition, size, and expertise. Committee members concurred that calling in experts for particular workshops may be necessary periodically, especially with regards to public health / toxicology and geothermal resources. For public health and toxicology, the committee may be able to call in the state's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA).

Membership

Carol	Roberts	CHAIR. USFWS (Selenium and Other Contaminants)
Tom	Anderson	USFWS (Avian)
Michael	Anderson	UC Riverside (Water & Water Quality)
Doug	Barnum	USGS (Selenium and other Contaminants)
Steve	Bigley	Coachella Valley Water District (Water & Water Quality)
Tim	Bradley	UC Irvine (Aquatic)
Mike	Chotkowski	USGS (Biology)
Amato	Evans	UCSD Scripps
Andrea	Jones	Audubon California (Avian)
Kurt	Leuschner	College of the Desert (Biology)
Jeong-Hee	Lim	Regional Water Quality Control Board (Water Quality)
Jason	Low	South Coast Air Pollution Control Dist. (Air Quality)
Robert	McKernan	Avian consultant (Birds)
Kathy	Molina	LA County Natural History Museum
Geoff	Schladow	UC Davis (Water and Water Quality)
Dave	Shuford	Point Blue Conservation (Birds)
Ramona	Swenson	ESA Associates (Aquatic)
Earl	Withycombe	CARB

Charge and Guidelines

The Committee approved its guidelines as a working draft, but discussed adding in a provision on media relations. Committee members agree that members will only speak on their own individual perspective and avoid commenting on behalf of another member or on behalf of the committee or its work. Bruce Wilcox, Assistant Secretary of Natural Resources, would be called upon to speak on behalf of committee outcomes.

Public Comment

In response to a public comment on how the committee members who are also regulatory staff will manage the review of dust mitigation measures that are not currently agency-approved Best Approved Control Measures (BACM), Earl Withycombe, CARB, said that he would need to think this over and provide some language to the chair for committee consideration.

2018 Meeting Topics

In addition to the science meeting, the Committee identified some topics that might be of interest to discuss in 2018; however, the group did not reach a conclusion. Chair Carol Roberts will think about this more, and the Committee can continue to consult with convener Bruce Wilcox, thinking through the State's needs and priorities.

- Monitoring

- Adaptive management – when data are available
- Perimeter lake concept – was only reviewed once 17 years ago for a proposal submitted by Michael Cohen

Public Comment

Alan Boyes would like to speak with a scientist about growing trees to reduce dust emissions. He is working with professors from Stanford and another university to remove selenium on private lands.

Meeting Attendees

About 10 members of the public attended the Science Committee meeting in addition to the following.

State of California

Bruce Wilcox, Assistant Secretary, Natural Resources

Bill Brownlie, Consultant, Tetra Tech

Members Attending

Present			
✓	Carol	Roberts	CHAIR. USFWS (Selenium and Other Contaminants)
✓	Tom	Anderson	USFWS (Avian)
✓	Michael	Anderson	UC Riverside (Water & Water Quality)
✓	Doug	Barnum	USGS (Selenium and other Contaminants)
✓	Steve	Bigley	Coachella Valley Water District (Water & Water Quality)
✓	Tim	Bradley	UC Irvine (Aquatic)
✓	Mike	Chotkowski	USGS (Biology)
✓	Amato	Evans	UCSD Scripps
✓	Andrea	Jones	Audubon California (Avian)
	Kurt	Leuschner	College of the Desert (Biology)
	Jeong-Hee	Lim	Regional Water Quality Control Board (Water Quality)
✓	Jason	Low	South Coast Air Pollution Control Dist. (Air Quality)
✓	Robert	McKernan	Avian consultant (Birds)
	Kathy	Molina	LA County Natural History Museum
	Geoff	Schladow	UC Davis (Water and Water Quality)
✓	Dave	Shuford	Point Blue Conservation (Birds)
✓	Ramona	Swenson	ESA Associates (Aquatic)
✓	Earl	Withycombe	CARB

Facilitator

CBI Facilitator Gina Bartlett, gina@cbuilding.org, 415-271-0049